

## SOUTH AFRICAN REVENUE SERVICE

#### **INTERPRETATION NOTE NO. 43**

DATE: 10 August 2007

ACT : INCOME TAX ACT, NO. 58 OF 1962 (the Act)
SECTION : SECTION 9B
SUBJECT : CIRCUMSTANCES IN WHICH AMOUNTS RECEIVED OR ACCRUED ON DISPOSAL OF LISTED SHARES ARE DEEMED TO BE OF A CAPITAL NATURE

#### 1. Purpose

The purpose of this Note is to provide clarity on the interpretation and application of section 9B.

On 21 February 2007 it was announced in the Budget Review that a wider spectrum of shares disposed of after three years would trigger a capital gains tax event and that this proposal will take effect on 1 October 2007. This proposal will only be addressed once the amending legislation is in place.

References in this Note to sections are to sections of the Act unless otherwise indicated.

Practice Note No. 18, issued on 23 April 1993, is hereby withdrawn.

This Note reflects the law as amended by the Taxation Laws Amendment Act, No. 8 of 2007.

## 2. Background

The distinction between capital and revenue is fundamental to the tax system, but neither concept has proved capable of a satisfactory definition in the Act. The question whether shares are held as trading stock or as an investment will to a large extent depend on the intention of the taxpayer. Despite guidelines laid down by case law the determination of whether the profit or loss on disposal of a share falls on capital or revenue account is often a contentious matter. For a discussion on the capital *versus* revenue issue, see the SARS *Tax Brochure for Share Owners*, and the *Comprehensive Guide to Capital Gains Tax*, both of which are available from the SARS website.

Section 9B is intended to provide a so-called "safe haven" for shares listed on a South African-registered stock exchange held for a period of at least five

continuous years. This has the effect that a person considered to have held shares on revenue account can rely on section 9B to have the profit on disposal of the qualifying shares taxed under the more favourable capital gains tax legislation. It is, however, important to note that an election under section 9B does not mean that the disposal of shares held for a shorter period than five continuous years will automatically fall on revenue account. Section 9B does not dispense with the ordinary rules for determining the nature of the amounts derived when shares are sold; it merely provides that, upon election, a taxpayer can choose that the profit on disposal of shares held for a continuous period of at least five years will be of a capital nature.

This Note focuses primarily on taxpayers who hold their shares as trading stock. Those who hold their shares on capital account can also avail themselves of section 9B should they require assurance that the profits on disposal of shares held for at least five years will be of a capital nature.

## 3. The law

Section 9B provides as follows:

"1)	mear defin imme	ns à l ition o ediately	rposes of this section – <b>"affected share"</b> , in relation to any taxpayer, isted share in a company as contemplated in paragraph ( <i>a</i> ) of the f "listed company", which has been disposed of by the taxpayer who y prior to such disposal had been the owner of such share as a listed continuous period of at least five years: Provided that –	
	(a)			
	( <i>b</i> )	in wh subd capita such	e any other share or shares are issued to such taxpayer by the company nich he holds such share in substitution for any such share by reason of a ivision of any such share or any similar arrangement, or any alization share in relation to such share is issued by such company to taxpayer, such share and such other share or shares or such alization share shall be deemed to be one and the same share if	
		i)	such taxpayer's participation rights and interests, whatsoever, in such company remain unaltered; and	
		ii)	no consideration whatsoever passes directly or indirectly from such taxpayer to such company in relation to the issue of such other share or shares or such capitalization share;	
	( <i>C</i> )	the taxpayer shall be deemed to have disposed of a share if the share has been cancelled or redeemed or if the relevant company has been liquidated or deregistered.		
	( <i>d</i> )	where the taxpayer is a registered insurer in terms of the Insurance Act, 1943 (Act No. 27 of 1943), and has acquired a share in accordance with a transfer of insurance business as contemplated in section 25A of that Act from another insurer who carried on long-term and short-term insurance business, both such insurers shall be deemed to be one and the same insurer [Note: The Insurance Act, 1943 was repealed by section 73 of the Long-term Insurance Act, No. 52 of 1998 and by section 1 of the Taxation Laws Amendment Act, No. 30 of 2002]; and		
	( <i>e</i> )	wher	e –	
		i)	any share has been lent by a lender to a borrower in terms of a securities lending arrangement, such share shall for the purposes of the lender be deemed not to have been disposed of by the lender; and	

quantity and quality has been returned by the borrower to the lender, such share and such other share shall be deemed to be one and the same share in the hands of the lender.		
Any taxpayer may elect that any amount received by or accrued to or in favour him as a result of the disposal on or after 14 March 1990 of an affected share, be deemed to be of a capital nature for the purposes of the definition of "gross income in section 1: Provided that where the taxpayer is a natural person who dies or declared insolvent during his ownership in an affected share or is a company which is liquidated during its ownership in such share, the executor of such person deceased estate or the curator of such person's insolvent estate or the liquidator such company may exercise the election in terms of this subsection.		
The election referred to in subsection (2) shall be exercised in respect of the firs affected share disposed of by any taxpayer on or after 14 March 1990, and such election shall be made by such taxpayer in his return of income in respect of the relevant year of assessment in which he disposed of such affected share.		
<ul> <li>(a) Any election made under subsection (2) in respect of an affected share disposed of prior to 18 March 1992, may be withdrawn by the taxpayer or the executor, curator or liquidator referred to in the proviso to the said subsection and be replaced by a new election which shall be exercised in respect of the first affected share disposed of by the taxpayer on or after that date.</li> <li>(b) The provisions of subsections (2), (3) and (4) shall <i>mutatis mutandis</i> apply to a new election made under paragraph (a).</li> </ul>		
An election made under subsection (2) shall be binding upon the taxpayer in respect of each succeeding disposal of an affected share during the year of assessment in which he exercised his election and every succeeding year of assessment.		
The provisions of this section shall not apply to any affected shares where such shares constitute shares which were deemed to be trading stock of the taxpayer in terms of section $24A(2)(a)$ of this Act.		
If any taxpayer has elected that the provisions of this section shall apply to him, there shall in the year of assessment in which any affected share is disposed of by him, be included in his income any expenditure or losses (excluding so much of any such expenditure or losses as may be allowable as a deduction in the determination of the taxable income derived by the taxpayer from dividends) incurred in respect of such affected share and allowed as a deduction from the income of such taxpayer during such or any previous year of assessment, and any amount allowed to be deducted from the cost price of such affected share under the provisions of section 22(1) in any such year.		
Where the taxpayer holds affected shares in any company which were acquired by him on different dates and he has disposed of any of those shares, he shall for the purposes of this section be deemed to have disposed of the affected shares held by him for the longest period of time.		
For the purposes of this section any amount included in the income of any taxpayer in terms of section $22(8)(b)$ as a result of the application, disposal or distribution of any affected share as contemplated in that section, is deemed to be an amount which has accrued to that taxpayer as a result of the disposal of that affected share.		

Section 9B is limited to "affected shares". Affected shares mean listed shares held for a continuous period of at least five years prior to the date of disposal.

ii)

4.

any other share of the same kind and of the same or equivalent

#### **Example 1 – Affected shares**

Facts: JSE-listed shares are acquired on 1 June 2002.

Result: The shares will qualify as affected shares as from 1 June 2007.

"Listed shares" are shares held in a company where its shares are listed on an exchange as defined in section 1 of the Securities Services Act, No. 36 of 2004 and licensed in terms of section 10 of that Act. Presently the only such exchange is the JSE Ltd (JSE).

The word "share" is not defined in section 1 and must be given its ordinary meaning. It does not, therefore, include instruments such as debentures, stocks, bonds and participatory interests in collective investment schemes as contemplated in the Collective Investment Schemes Control Act, No. 45 of 2002. However, affected shares include JSE-listed preference shares.

Shares received as a result of a rights issue are new shares and will not be affected shares until they have been held for a period of at least five continuous years.

## 4.2 Disposal of affected shares

The word "disposal" has not been defined and must be given its ordinary meaning. The word indicates an event which results in the owner of shares ceasing to be the owner of those shares. Shares are deemed to be disposed of if they are cancelled or redeemed or if the company has been liquidated or deregistered.

In certain circumstances the continuous ownership of affected shares is preserved despite the fact that the original share may have been disposed of. These circumstances are as follows:

- a) Substitution by reason of a share split or similar arrangement or the issue of capitalisation shares in relation to such share if
  - i) the taxpayer's participation rights and interests remain unaltered; and
  - ii) no consideration, either directly or indirectly, was given for such shares.
- b) Securities lending arrangements Where any share has been lent by a lender to a borrower under a "securities lending arrangement" as defined in section 1, the share will be deemed not to have been disposed of by the lender, provided another share of the same kind and of the same or equivalent quantity and quality will be returned by the borrower to the lender. Upon subsequent return of the shares the replacement shares are deemed to be the same as the original shares borrowed.
- c) Distributions by trusts Where a beneficiary acquires shares by way of a distribution from a trust, the ownership of the shares by the trustee and

thereafter by the beneficiary is not considered to be continuous. However, in the case of a "bewind trust" ownership of assets remains vested in the beneficiary while the assets are held by the trust and the trustee merely acts as an administrator. When the shares are distributed to the beneficiary, the period of ownership is considered to be continuous.

d) Upon insolvency the estate of the insolvent person is deemed to be the same person as the estate of that person prior to insolvency. The transfer of the shares between the estates does not give rise to a disposal for purposes of section 9B.

#### Example 2 – Capitalization shares

*Facts:* In year 1, D acquired 1 000 shares in ABC Ltd, a company listed on the JSE. In year 4 the company issued five capitalization shares in respect of every 100 shares held by its shareholders, thereby increasing D's holding to 1 050 shares. In year 6, D disposed of the 1 050 shares. D had previously made an election in terms of section 9B.

*Result:* In terms of paragraph (*b*) of the proviso to section 9B(1) the capitalization shares are deemed to be acquired in year 1 despite being received in year 4. Any profit or loss on disposal of the 1 050 shares will therefore be of a capital nature.

#### Example 3 – Share split

*Facts:* In year 1, H acquired 100 shares in XYZ Ltd, a company listed on the JSE. In year 4, XYZ Ltd split its shares, with two new shares being issued for every one share held. In year 6 H disposed of 100 of the 200 XYZ Ltd shares. H had previously made an election under section 9B.

*Result:* In terms of paragraph (*b*) of the proviso to section 9B(1) the 100 shares disposed of are deemed to have been acquired in year 1 even though they were issued to H in year 4.

## 4.3 Election

Section 9B(2) enables a taxpayer to elect that any amount received by or accrued to or in favour of that taxpayer as a result of the disposal of an affected share, be treated as being of a capital nature for the purposes of the definition of "gross income" in section 1. Should a taxpayer elect that the deemed capital rule be applied, any profit or loss on disposal of an affected share will be treated as being of a capital nature. As a result, a capital gain or loss must be determined under the Eighth Schedule to the Act for capital gains tax purposes.

## 4.3.1 Timing of the election

In order to access the safe haven provisions of section 9B a taxpayer must make an election. The election must be exercised by the taxpayer in the return of income in respect of the year of assessment in which the *first* "affected share" is disposed of.

When section 9B was first introduced with effect from 14 March 1990 it provided for a 10-year holding period. This was later reduced to five years by section 9(1)(c) of the Income Tax Act, No. 141 of 1992. Taxpayers who had made an election under the original legislation were permitted to make a fresh election which applied to the first affected share disposed of on or after 18 March 1992 (section 9B(3A)).

An election under the current legislation thus applies to

- persons who were not bound by the original legislation because they did not dispose of shares held for at least 10 years between 14 March 1990 and 18 March 1992, and
- those who were bound by the original legislation but made a fresh election as described above.

Thus, under the current legislation, if a taxpayer has for the first time

- disposed of JSE-listed shares held for at least five years, and
- failed to make an election in respect of those shares,

that taxpayer may not make an election under section 9B in respect of any future disposal of a JSE-listed share. This applies regardless of whether the first disposal of "affected shares" was on capital or revenue account.

Section 9B is restrictive in its application and the timing of the election is critical. Persons who have never previously made an election under section 9B will be unable to do so unless they have –

- not previously sold JSE-listed shares; or
- previously sold JSE-listed shares, but always within five years of acquisition.

#### Example 4 – Failure to make an election at the time of the first disposal

*Facts:* In 1991 C acquired shares in ABC Ltd and XYZ Ltd, both JSE-listed companies, for the purposes of resale at a profit. Between 1991 and 2006 C bought and sold various other JSE-listed shares all within two years of purchase.

In 1997 C sold the ABC Ltd shares at a loss of R80 000 which was claimed against C's taxable income. C did not make an election at the time under section 9B as doing so would have prevented C from claiming the loss. In 2006 C sold the XYZ Ltd shares at a profit of R500 000 and sought to make an election under section 9B in order to have the profit classified as being of a capital nature.

*Result:* C is not permitted to make the election. Had C wished to take advantage of section 9B, C should have made the election at the time when C disposed of the first "affected shares", namely, those in ABC Ltd which C had held for more than five years.

Once exercised, the election under section 9B(2) is final and binding on the taxpayer.

## 4.3.2 Effect of making an election

Once an election has been made in respect of an "affected share" it is binding for all future years of assessment. The election is also binding on the curator of an insolvent estate or the trustee of a deceased estate if the election was made by a person prior to death or insolvency. If no election has previously been made the executor or curator, as the case may be, may make the election.

In terms of section 9B(4), the election exercised in terms of section 9B(2) is binding in respect of each succeeding disposal of any affected share during the year of assessment in which the taxpayer exercised the election and every succeeding year of assessment. It is important to note that the election is exercised only once, i.e. when the first affected share is disposed of by the taxpayer. The election is binding in respect of all affected shares disposed of by the taxpayer and not only in respect of the first share disposed of.

## Example 5 – Election binding in respect of all JSE-listed shares held

*Facts:* A taxpayer holds 1 000 shares in A Ltd and 2 000 shares in B Ltd for longer than five years and disposes of 500 shares in A Ltd in year 6.

*Result:* The taxpayer must exercise an election in year 6 and that election is not only binding in respect of the A Ltd shares, but also in respect of the B Ltd shares.

## 4.4 Circumstances in which section 9B does not apply

Section 9B does not apply where -

- a) a taxpayer fails to make an election;
- b) the shares are deemed to be trading stock in terms of section 24A(2)(*a*); or
- c) section 8C applies.

Section 24A deals with shares acquired prior to 1 October 2001 in exchange for shares or fixed property held as trading stock. Section 24A excluded the value of the shares received under the exchange from income but deemed those shares and any capitalization shares in respect of them to be trading stock. Section 8C deals with the taxation of directors and employees in respect of the vesting of an "equity instrument". The term "equity instrument" includes a share (section 8C(7)). The opening words of section 8C(1)(a) provide that gains and losses derived upon vesting of equity instruments must be included in or deducted from income "[n]otwithstanding section 9B . . .".

## 4.5 Recoupment of expenditure and losses

In terms of section 9B(6) any costs or losses allowed to a taxpayer in respect of an affected share must be recouped in the hands of the taxpayer on disposal of an affected share if the taxpayer has made an election under section 9B. This recoupment also includes any reduction in the cost price of the share in terms of section 22(1)(a), but excludes any costs or losses which have been allowed as a deduction in the determination of the taxpayer's taxable income from dividends.

## Example 6 – Recoupment of share-dealing expenditure previously allowed under section 11(*a*)

*Facts:* In year 1, Z bought shares in ABC Ltd, a JSE-listed company with the intention of reselling them at a profit. The following expenditure was incurred by Z in years 1 to 6.

	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	Year 6
	R	R	R	R	R	R
Interest	500	700	900	700	500	400
Management fee	200	250	300	400	450	500
Other costs	600	200	300	500	300	400
Total costs	<u>1 300</u>	1 150	1 500	1 600	1 250	1 300

The expenditure incurred in years 1 to 5 had been claimed and allowed as a deduction under section 11(a).

During year 6, Z sold the shares and made an election under section 9B in his return of income for that year.

*Result:* The expenditure allowed in years 1 to 5 which amounted to R6 800 is deemed to be recouped and must be included in Z's income in year 6. As the proceeds are deemed to be of a capital nature, the expenditure incurred in year 6 will not qualify as a deduction under section 11(a) read with section 23(f).

# 4.6 The application of the first-in-first-out (FIFO) method on disposal of affected shares

Section 9B(7) deals with the situation where a taxpayer has acquired shares in a listed company on various dates and disposes of some of them. It then becomes necessary to identify which shares have been disposed of in order to determine whether they have been held for the qualifying five-year period. For this purpose section 9B(7) prescribes the FIFO method.

Example 7 – Compulsory use of FIFO				
Facts: Y purchased and sold the following shares in B Ltd:				
	Purchases	Sales		
Year 1	500			
Year 3	1 000			
Year 7	1 500			
Year 8		400		
Year 9		1 400		
Result: If Y made an election under section 9B -				
(a)	the 400 shares disposed of in year 8 will represent affected shares under the FIFO method, as they form part of the 500 shares purchased on 30 June year 1 and were thus held for a continuous period of at least five years; and			
(b)	affected shares, namely purchased in year 1 plu The remaining 300 sha	0 shares disposed of in year 9 represent 7, the remaining 100 shares which were is the 1 000 shares purchased in year 3. res were disposed of within the five-year for safe haven status under section 9B.		

## 4.7 Treatment of trading stock

In terms of section 22(1) any person other than a company may reduce the value of shares to their market value at the end of the year of assessment. For example, if a person bought shares at R100 per share during the year of assessment, and their value decreased to R80 at the end of the year of assessment, the difference qualifies as a reduction in terms of section 22(1) against the value that must be brought to income as representing the cost of the trading stock.

## Example 8 – Adjustment in respect of write down of trading stock

*Facts:* In year 1, X an individual, bought 1 000 JSE-listed shares at R200 per share. At the end of the year of assessment the market value of the shares was only R150 per share. During years 2 to 6 the value of the shares increased, and at the end of year 6, X disposed of the shares for proceeds of R300 per share and made an election under section 9B. This was X's first disposal of JSE-listed shares held for at least five years.

#### Result:

Year 1	R	R
Cost of shares		(200 000)
Closing stock at cost price	200 000	
Less: Reduction in market value	(50 000)	
Value of closing stock included in in	<u>150 000</u>	
Reduction in taxable income	<u>(50 000)</u>	

In terms of section 9B(6) allowable expenditure and losses incurred before the disposal must be added back in arriving at taxable income.

	R	
Opening stock (section 22(2))	(150 000)	
Add: Section 9B(6) adjustments	· · · · ·	
Opening stock	150 000	
Reduction in trading stock (year 1)	<u>50 000</u>	
Increase in taxable income	<u>50 000</u>	

For capital gains tax purposes, assuming the shares were acquired on or after the valuation date, the capital gain will be determined as follows:

	R
Proceeds	300 000
Less: Base cost	( <u>200 000</u> )
Capital gain	100 000

Section 22(8)(*b*) deems a taxpayer to have recouped amounts previously allowed as a deduction in respect of the cost of trading stock disposed of by means other than a normal sale (e.g. by donation, distribution *in specie*, etc). For the purposes of section 9B, section 9B(8) deems the amount so recouped to accrue to the shareholder. This deemed accrual is necessary as section 9B(2) only applies if there is a receipt or accrual.

#### 5. Conclusion

Once an election has been made in terms of section 9B, it is binding and cannot be reversed. Taxpayers are advised to keep a proper record of any expenditure claimed against taxable income in respect of their share-dealing activities.

## Legal and Policy Division SOUTH AFRICAN REVENUE SERVICE